

Chief Judge Guidebook

Compiled by Mark Kramer, DTM

Original Date: March 2010 as the District 5 Judging Chair

Updated: May 2011, May 2012, May 2013, May 2015, May 2016, May 2018, May 2019, August 2019

Congratulations! You're serving as the Chief Judge for an area or division contest! These guidelines may help you get ready by suggesting how to prepare for the contest, suggesting what to bring to the contest, suggesting what to do at the contest, and suggesting what to do following the contest. In addition, you'll find suggested briefings for judges and functionaries.

Before The Contest

- Attend Chief Judge Training for a refresher and to become familiar with new rules. See the www.d5tm.org website for dates of training sessions.
- **Read the latest update of the Speech Contest Rulebook** on the www.toastmasters.org website; just search for "speech contest rulebook" (item 1171 or 1171DCD). The rulebook takes precedence over anything in this document.
- Work with the Contest Chair to find Judges.
 - Contest Chairs are generally tasked with recruiting judges from clubs. Members are encouraged to contact the area/division director to volunteer.
 - For an area contest, there must be an equal number of judges from each club with a minimum of 5 judges. For a division contest, there must be an equal number of judges from each area with a minimum of 7 judges. Consider finding two additional as backups. Judges should remain anonymous.
 - Each judge (including Chief Judge and tiebreaking judge) must have completed at least 6 speeches from the Competent Communicator manual or Levels 1 and 2 of a Pathways path.
 - Judges for an area contest or higher are ineligible to compete at any level during the contest season.
- Also coordinate the following with the Contest Chair:
 - Who will bring all forms for judges, timers, and counters? Also, the photo release forms and video release forms will be needed. While the photo and video release forms are given to the Chief Judge before the contest, it is the responsibility of the Contest Chair to retain these two forms for one year following the contest.
 - If there will be an Evaluation Contest, remind the Contest Chair that the Test Speaker should be a Toastmaster from a club not competing in the contest, is from a different area or division than that competing, and is not a contestant this season. The Test Speaker may only present a contest-type speech, a Competent Communicator manual speech, or a Pathways speech. The project must not be announced. A Test Speaker may only be used during any one contest season. Contestants may only take notes and prepare notes using the Evaluation Contestant Notes form (item 1177). Ensure that the Contest Chair prints several copies for each contestant.
 - If there will be a Table Topics Contest, who will supply the questions? Will it be the District Contest Chair? If it is the Contest Chair then ask the Contest Chair to write 3-5 questions and place each in a sealed envelope for the Toastmaster to select during the contest. The number of questions and the sealing of questions in envelopes is not a requirement but has become a tradition.

- Request the Toastmaster collect and provide the completed "Speaker's Certification of Eligibility and Originality" and "Speech Contestant Profile" forms from each contestant prior to the start of the contest.
- Confirm that you will brief the judges, timers, and counters.
- Confirm that the Contest Chair will provide you with the Certificates of Appreciation so you can give them to the judges during their briefing.
- Decide who will bring the stop watch. Technically, it is the responsibility of the Chief Judge. Usually, the responsibility is delegated to someone else.
- Confirm that you will be reimbursed for judging packet supplies (you must bring a receipt to the contest and present it to the Contest Chair).
- Remind the Contest Chair that, if a contestant is disqualified on the basis of originality or eligibility that you will notify the Contest Chair and it is the Contest Chair's responsibility to speak with the contestant before the adjourning.
- Personally find a tiebreaking judge. The tiebreaking judge must have completed 6 speeches from the Competent Communicator manual or Levels 1 and 2 on a Pathway's path. The Tiebreaking Judge must remain anonymous from all others.
- Will you or the Contest Chair email the judges, timers, and counters prior to the contest to ensure that all know their duties? Usually it is the Contest Chair. If you email them, take this opportunity to remind them of the location for the contest and what time they should arrive. Consider sending the briefing examples found later in this document.
 - For the judges, ask them to confirm which area and division they are in, that they have given at least 6 speeches from the Competent Communicator manual or Levels 1 and 2 of a Pathways path, and that they are not a contestant in another contest. Consider including a copy of the Speech Contest Rulebook, the Judge Certification Of Eligibility and Ethics form in your email to each judge (you may download the PDF versions from the Toastmasters.org website). IMPORTANT: email the tiebreaking judge separately. When emailing, attach samples of the ballots and rules.
- If you will be creating the judges' packets:
 - Purchase folders at stores that sell office supplies such as Staples, Wal-Mart, etc. The thicker the folder the easier it is for the judges to use to write on.
 - Include the Judge's Certification of Eligibility and Code of Ethics form (form 1170DCD may be downloaded free from the Toastmasters website). Each judge must sign it and give it to you.
 - Include a judge's form for each contest. You should cut off the bottom portion of the form about 80% of the way. If there is more than one area contest, write the number of the area at the top and bottom of each form.
 - Include an envelope for the judge to place each contest's ballot.
 - Before the briefing, insert the judges' Certificates of Appreciation into their folders.

What To Bring To The Contest

- If you will be preparing the judges packets, bring them for each judge, including the tiebreaking judge.
- If you will be providing non-judge forms, such as timer forms and counter forms and photo and video release forms, bring the forms.

- Technically, you are responsible for bringing the stop watch to the contest. Someone else, though, will probably be given responsibility to bring one – coordinate this with the Contest Chair. Nevertheless, consider bringing one just in case.
- Bring pens for the judges, timers, and counters in case they are needed.
- A deck of cards (or just Ace through 6) to select speaking order in case the Toastmaster did not bring cards.
- Receipt for any supplies you purchased such as the folders for the judges' packets.
- Even though you are not responsible for them, consider bringing extra supplies such as extra forms (especially the Evaluation Contestant Notes form if there is an evaluation contest), timing lights/cards, etc. You never know when these items may be needed.
- Envelopes for the judges to place their ballots.

At The Contest – Before It Starts

- Arrive 60 minutes early as requested by the Contest Chair.
- If there will be an Evaluation Contest, ask to be shown the room where the contestants will prepare their notes. If a room is not available, an area must be set aside for contestants to prepare their notes. The Sergeant at Arms is responsible for timing. Digital devices and other devices are not allowed.
- Get the judge's Certificates of Appreciation for the judges from the Contest Chair.
- Collect each contestant's "Speaker's Certification of Eligibility and Originality" forms from the Toastmaster. Ensure that each contestant is eligible: A contestant is a member in good standing and a member of a club in good standing (the club must have 8 members), and that the contestant is competing in only one area contest. If there will be an International Speech Contest then confirm that the contestant has completed at least 6 speeches from the Competent Communicator manual (exception: no minimum requirement for members of newly chartered clubs since July 1).
 - Clubs may select their contestants anyway they wish. If a club held a contest and no one competed and a member later volunteers, that's okay.
 - A contestant who is late and misses the briefing may still compete as long as the contestant has submitted a Speaker's Certificate of Eligibility and Originality", reports to the Contest Chair, and waives the opportunity for a briefing before the Toastmaster is introduced.
- Brief judges, timers, and counters. You must collect a signed "Judge's Certification of Eligibility and Code of Ethics" form from each judge.
- Privately brief the tiebreaker judge.
- Remind the Contest Chair that photography (even non-flash photography) and videography is not permitted unless the photographer, videographer, and subjects complete the Photo Release form and/or Video Release form 30 minutes prior to the contest.
 - Each member who potentially will be photographed or recorded must be briefed about the recording and must be told how the recording will be used (ex. will it be posted on the web?).
 - Those not signing the release forms may not be photographed or videotaped.
 - Photography and recording equipment must not cause a safety hazard to any in attendance and must not be a distraction to speakers or presenters.

- It is the Contest's Chair's responsibility to ensure that the photographer and videographer only record those who have given written permission and only posts photos or videos on the web of members who have given written permission.
- The Contest Chair must retain the release forms for at least a year after the contest.
- Remind the Toastmaster to announce any changes to the contestants as listed in the program and announce the speaking order of the contestants before the contest begins. Instruct the Toastmaster to speak slowly to give the judges time to write down the names.

At The Contest – Once It Starts

- Once the Toastmaster is announced, contestants who arrive later are disqualified. Contestants may skip the briefing by speaking with the Toastmaster beforehand but must be present at the start of the contest.
- Before each contest you will be asked to make these comments to the audience:
 - Please turn off all cell phones and other sound making devices. Airplane mode is not good enough; an Amber alert, for example, will sound through airplane mode.
 - No photographs are allowed during the contests, with or without flash, except by those who have signed the Toastmasters International Photo Release form.
 - No video recording is allowed during the contests except by those who have signed the Toastmasters International Video Release form.
 - Do not look at the timing devices when a contestant is speaking.
 - You may only get out of your seats between contestants. If you leave the room you may return only between contestants.
 - Remain silent for one minute between contestants and until after all ballots are collected following the last contestant of each contest.
 - Contestants, judges, timers, counters, and the audience have been briefed. Let the contest begin! Toastmaster!
- During the contest:
 - Remain in the room during the contest to watch for violations:
 - Audience members getting up while a contestant is speaking.
 - Audience members entering the room while a contestant is speaking.
 - The Toastmaster not allowing one minute between contestants.
 - The Toastmaster or audience members not remaining silent between contestants.
 - Problems with the timing signals.
 - Longer than 1 minute to set up for the contestant.
 - After the final contestant in a contest finishes, stand up and:
 - See that the counters collect the judge's ballots – only the bottom portion should be collected; the judge's keep the remainder of the form.
 - Personally collect the tiebreaking ballot discretely.
 - Personally collect the Time Record Sheet from the timers.
 - When all judge's ballots have been collected, announce that the ballots have been collected.
 - Leave the room with the counters to count the ballots.
 - Determine 1st, 2nd, and 3rd place for the contest:
 - Disqualify any judge's ballot that is not signed.

- Disqualify any judge's ballot that does not have at least three contestant names written down if there were at least three contestants.
 - Disqualify any judge's ballot that lists the name of someone not competing.
 - Disqualify any judge's ballot that has a contestant's name substantially wrong (ex. If the contestant in the program is Pat Smith but the name written is Chris Smith then the ballot is tossed; however, if the contestant's name in the program is James Smith but the ballot shows Jim Smith that is acceptable).
 - Oversee the counters as they count the ballots twice.
 - Even if it is obvious who won the contest simply by looking at the ballots, you must still count the ballots.
 - Only if there is a tie, use the tiebreaking ballot.
 - Disqualify any contestant for not speaking within the required time range.
 - If a protest is lodged by a judge or contestant over originality or eligibility see the Speech Contest Rulebook. Only a judge or contestant may protest. See the section "Disqualification Case Studies."
 - Write down 1st, 2nd, and 3rd place for the contest. Note if there were any disqualifications but do not provide details or names (e.g. "There was one disqualification.") See form at the end of this document.
 - Hand the contest results to the **director** presenting the awards. Do not hand the results to the contest Toastmaster or anyone else.
- If any contestant has been disqualified due to originality or eligibility, notify the Contest Chair and have the Contest Chair notify the contestant before the contest is adjourned.
 - At the end of the contest:
 - When the director calls on you to acknowledge your judges, you may *generically* thank them but **you must not name them and you must not ask them to stand up**. All judges must remain anonymous. If the Contest Chair did not provide you with the Certificates of Appreciation prior to your contest briefing to give to the judges, announce that you will provide the certificates after the contest.
 - Listen closely to the announcements of winners – interrupt immediately if there is a mistake.
 - **Do not** ask the judges to provide you with the top half of the ballot form; the judge's should take these with them and destroy them.

Immediately Following The Conclusion Of The Contest

- If the Contest Chair did not give you the judges' Certificates of Appreciation before the contest to place in each judge's folder, discretely hand each judge a certificate.
- Complete the "Notification Of Contest Winner" form (or a similar form that the District provides you) and hand it, along with the "Speaker's Certification Of Eligibility And Originality" and "Speech Contestant Profile" forms to the director for the next level. Providing the information to the District Contest Chair is also acceptable if the District Contest Chair plans to attend the next level of competition. If neither are available, you may give the forms to the Contest Chair or one of the contest directors.
- Hold on to all ballots, tally sheets, timer's sheets, judge's certification forms until after the next level of competition has been completed; then destroy them in a location other than where the contest was held.

Case Studies

Only a judge or contestant may issue a protest. No one else may protest. Should a judge or contestant protest, call all the judges together (except for the tiebreaking judge) in a private location and explain the protest. Then ask the contestant to join all of you. Explain the protest and give the contestant the opportunity to comment. Ask the contestant to return to the audience while the judges confer. Disqualify the contestant if a majority of judges agree to do so. Note that a speech can be disqualified only if it is "substantially" (i.e. about 75% per Toastmasters International) not original – see the Speech Contest Rulebook. If a contestant is disqualified, notify the Contest Chair and have the Contest Chair speak with the contestant before the contest ends.

Even though the rulebook states that disqualifications may only occur if a speech is not substantially original or for not meeting timing guidelines, Chief Judges have disqualified contestants for the following reasons because of the potential for bias:

- Evaluation contestants must not know the test speaker. At one contest, just before it began, an Evaluation contestant met someone and they began talking. It turned out he was the test speaker. Instead of immediately ending the conversation, the two continued talking anyway. During her contest evaluation, the contestant mentioned something that she had learned about the test speaker during their short pre-contest conversation. Since the other contestants were not privy to this information, the judges ruled that there was a bias and the contestant was disqualified.
- A member served as an area contest judge for an area not associated with his club. However, he was barred from competing in his own area contest after winning his club contest! Why? Because it was possible that if he won his area contest he might compete against this area's winner. What's wrong with that? It's possible that, knowing this, he might have voted for the weaker contestant so he would have easier competition.
- In an evaluation contest, a judge realized that the test speaker at a contest was from the same club as one of the evaluation contestants. The judges conferred after the test speaker spoke, declared it an invalid speech, and selected a volunteer from the audience to give another test speech to ensure that no contestant had prior knowledge of the test speaker.
- An area contest chair had won her club's speech contest but was not allowed to compete in the area contest because she had selected the judges for the area contest and it might have appeared that she had chosen judges who would be biased towards her.
- A contestant did not hear the Toastmaster call the contestants for their briefing and missed it. When the Toastmaster announced the speaking order, the contestant didn't hear his name and let the Toastmaster know that he was present. The Toastmaster told him that she had called all the contestants for the briefing multiple times and, since he missed the briefing, he was disqualified. The Chief Judge intervened and allowed the contestant to compete because, she said, the rulebook states that contestants have the right to waive the briefing. In this case, all parties had it wrong. The Toastmaster cannot disqualify anyone; only the Chief Judge may disqualify a contestant. Contestants cannot be disqualified for missing the briefing. Contestants have the right to waive it; however, a contestant who waives the briefing must still report to the Toastmaster, request to waive the briefing, and submit a certificate of eligibility form prior to the introduction of the Toastmaster. In this case, the contestant should have been disqualified for not reporting to the Toastmaster before the Toastmaster's introduction. Had the contestant told the Toastmaster he was waiving the briefing after handing in his form it becomes the Contest Chair's responsibility to either appoint the contestant as the last competitor or gather all contestants to draw speaking order prior to the introduction of the Toastmaster. Contestants are reminded of these rules in both the Speech Contest Rulebook and in the email sent to contestants if the Contest Chair is using the District 5 Organizing Area & Division Contests Guidebook.

- While not a case yet, evaluation contestants must use the Evaluation Contestant Notes form (item 1177). Contestants may not use anything else for notes. If none are supplied at the contest then contestants will have nothing to write notes on.

The Chief Judge must remain in the room at all times when contestants are competing and when the Test Speaker is speaking during an evaluation contest. At a dual-area contest where the plan was to hold the Humorous Speech Contest for the second area immediately following the first area, the Chief Judge and the ballot counters walked out of the room after collecting the 1st area's ballots. The Chief Judge did not return to the room until after the second area's contest had concluded. The Chief Judge should have held on to the first area contest's ballots and then left the room to count the ballots after the second area contest concluded.

JUDGES, TIMERS, AND COUNTERS BRIEFING EXAMPLES

Gather all timers, counters, and judges – except the tiebreaking judge. Hand each judge a folder that includes the judging forms (with the bottom mostly torn off), envelopes, and, if you wish, a copy of the Speech Contest Rulebook and this briefing.

Timer Briefing

1. Only one "Time Record Sheet And Instructions For Timers", stopwatch, and timing signal will be used (lights are preferred but cards are okay if necessary).
2. While not required, consider this format: For the first contest, one Timer works the stopwatch and signal while the other records the time. Then switch for the second contest.
3. Begin timing upon the first definite verbal or nonverbal communication to the audience. This includes a word uttered, special effect, staged act, etc.
4. Time as follows:
 - a. Int'l Speech Contest: 5 min (green), 6 min (yellow), 7 min (red)
 - b. Humorous Speech Contest: 5 min (green), 6 min (yellow), 7 min (red)
 - c. Tall Tales Contest: 3 min (green), 4 min (yellow), 5 min (red)
 - d. Evaluation Contest: 2 min (green), 2:30 min (yellow), 3 min (red)
 - e. Table Topics Contest: 1 min (green), 1:30 min (yellow), 2 min (red)
5. For speeches, if a contestant speaks for 30 seconds less than the minimum time or 30 seconds longer than the maximum time, circle the time to indicate a disqualification. For Table Topics contestants must speak for a minimum of 1 minute and no more than 2:30.
6. Between each contestant, time for 1 minute and signal the Toastmaster by showing red when the 1 minute is up. After the last contestant in a contest, do not time.
7. After the last contestant in a contest, hold up the "Time Record Sheet And Instructions For Timers" form for me to collect.
8. Times are confidential and should not be discussed with anyone during or after the contest.
9. If someone disqualified by time is announced as a winner, please raise your hand and state out loud, "There is an error." I'll come speak to you.
10. Time the break for the amount of time listed in the program. Let the Sergeants at Arms know when there is five minutes remaining in the break.
11. That's it! Now, if you would, please go to the timing table to demonstrate the signaling devices to the contestants so we can be certain they can see you signal.

Counters Briefing:

1. Please stand following the last contestant in a contest. Judges will hold up their envelopes when their ballot is ready to be collected. Please do not hover around judges.
2. Hold up fingers for each envelope collected so I know how many ballots have been collected.
3. Once we have all the envelopes, come with me to a room to count the ballots.
4. You'll use the "Counter's Tally Sheet" to tally scores; even if the winners seem obvious.
5. Disqualify any ballot that is not signed or has a non-contestant name written.
6. Ballots are confidential. Scores are not to be discussed with anyone after the contest.
7. If the contest winners are announced in the wrong order, it is your responsibility to raise up a hand and state out loud, "There is an error." I'll come speak with you.
8. Counters may be excused.

Judges' Briefing:

1. Right now, read and sign the "Judge's Certification of Eligibility and Code of Ethics" form and hand me the signed form. Once I have your signed forms I can continue the briefing.
2. Review each contest's criteria on the reverse of each judging form. This is the only criteria that you should use during the contests. Try to eliminate any bias from your judging.
3. Your sole task is to select 1st, 2nd, and 3rd best in each contest based on the criteria.
4. The scoring points shown on the judging form are guidelines for your personal use; you do not need to use the suggested points.
5. If you end up with a tie on your ballot, you must break the tie yourself.
6. Sign the bottom of each judging form – even do it now. Unsigned ballots cannot be counted.
7. Wait for the Toastmaster to announce the speaking order before writing names on the form.
8. Speeches must be **substantially** original. According to TI: The majority of the speech – 75% -- must be original material. Citations can be used as long as they are referenced. If quotes are used too often in a speech, the majority of the content is no longer original. Judges -- If you have any inclination that the speech is not original you may lodge a protest." (TI March/April 2011). If you feel **strongly** that the speech was substantially not original, while ballots are being collected **discretely** slip a note to me. After the ballots are collected and counted I will call the judges and the contestant together to discuss. A majority of judges must agree with the disqualification for a contestant to be disqualified.
9. Judge only on today's speech; do not consider past speeches.
10. Do not consider time when judging. The Timers are responsible for timing.
11. Contestants will be shown "the speaking area"; however, if a contestant steps beyond the speaking area it is not means for disqualification. The speaking area should be taken into consideration only if you feel that the movement was awkward or inappropriate.
12. Try to sit close enough to the contest area so you can see and hear the contestants easily in case there is an outside disturbance or the sound system fails. While it is not a requirement, you may wish to avoid sitting next to a contestant.
13. After each contestant you will have 1 minute to determine your score for the contestant.
14. After the final contestant in the contest you will have unlimited time to fill out the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd place names at the bottom of the form.
15. Write the names down as they appear in the program. For example, if the program says "James" do not write "Jim".
16. Only write contestant names on the ballot. If the program lists someone and that member did not actually compete and you write down the name, your ballot will be disqualified.
17. If there are three or more contestants you must write down a 1st, 2nd, and 3rd place names even if awards are only being given for 1st and 2nd.
18. After you've filled out the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd names and confirmed that you have signed the ballot, tear off the bottom of the form, fold it in half, stick it in the envelope, and hold the envelope in the air for a Counter to collect.
19. Do not discuss the judging of this contest or explain your judging with anyone, not even the contestants or other judges. You must remain anonymous and not tell others you judged.
20. Destroy your notes immediately after the contest in a location other than this venue.
21. If there are any questions, now is the time to ask; otherwise, you may return to your seats.

Tiebreaking Judge's Briefing (held privately away from others):

1. Right now, read and sign the "Judge's Certification of Eligibility and Code of Ethics" form and hand me the signed form. Once I have your signed forms I can continue the briefing.
2. Review each contest's criteria on the reverse of each judging form. This is the only criteria that you should use during the contests. Try to eliminate any bias from your judging.
3. Your sole task is to rank all contestants in each contest based on the criteria. If there are five contestants in a contest then you must write down all five names.
4. The scoring points shown on the judging form are guidelines for your personal use; you do not need to use the suggested points.
5. If you end up with a tie on your ballot, you must break the tie yourself.
6. Sign the bottom of each judging form – even do it now. Unsigned ballots cannot be counted.
7. Wait for the Toastmaster to announce the speaking order before writing names on the form.
8. "It is best for the tiebreaking judge to **not** make any protests" unless you feel strongly that the speech is not **substantially** original. According to TI, the majority of the speech – 75% -- must be original material. Citations can be used as long as they are referenced. If quotes are used too often in a speech, the majority of the content is no longer original. (TI March/April 2011). **Discretely** slip a note to me if you **feel strongly** that the speech was substantially not original. When I gather the judges together to discuss a protest you must **NOT** join them. You are to remain anonymous.
9. Judge only on today's speech; do not consider past speeches.
10. Do not consider time when judging. The Timers are responsible for timing.
11. Contestants will be shown "the speaking area"; however, if a contestant steps beyond the speaking area it is not means for disqualification. The speaking area should be taken into consideration only if you feel that the movement was awkward or inappropriate.
12. While not a requirement, tiebreaking judges often sit in the very back row and avoid sitting next to contestants and other judges to help secure anonymity.
13. After each contestant you will have 1 minute to determine your score for the contestant.
14. After the final contestant in the contest you will have unlimited time to rank all contestants and write their names at the bottom of the form. **You must rank every contestant.**
15. Write the names down as they appear in the program. For example, if the program says "James" do not write "Jim".
16. Only write contestant names on the ballot. If the program lists someone and that member did not actually compete and you write down the name, your ballot will be disqualified.
17. After you've ranked all contestants at the bottom of the form and confirmed that you have signed the ballot, tear off the bottom, fold it in half, place it in the envelope, and discretely hand it to me. **Do not** waive it in the air for a Counter to pick up.
18. Do not discuss the judging of this contest or explain your judging with anyone, not even the contestants or other judges. You must remain anonymous and not tell others you judged.
19. Destroy your notes immediately after the contest in a location other than this venue.

Chief Judge – Please fill out this form and hand to the director who will announce the winners.

Director – please read the information in the order listed below (i.e. announce disqualifications, then 3rd place, then 2nd place, then 1st place of the first contest then disqualifications, then 3rd place, then 2nd place, then 1st place of the second contest).

For the _____ Contest:

There were _____ disqualifications due to time (do not indicate names).

3rd Place _____

2nd Place _____

1st Place _____

For the _____ Contest:

There were _____ disqualifications due to time (do not indicate names).

3rd Place _____

2nd Place _____

1st Place _____